

---

Subject: : Conservation

Topic: : A Lancaster County Brookie Stream

Re: A Lancaster County Brookie Stream

Author: : Fishidiot

Date: : 2008/11/1 17:00:01

URL:

I would respectfully disagree with MKern's contention that isolated brookie populations have poor fish. My experience is that here in PA, brookies (most of the time) are healthiest and largest where they're the top predator with little or no competition with other trout. There are some obvious exceptions, like the Savage River in MD. Game fish that have evolved over millenia in competition, such as pike, smallmouths and muskies, tend to grow largest and best in environments where they're together. In Great Smokies NP they are convinced that barriers are the key to brookies thriving - and while more time and data will sharpen the conclusions, at this time they appear to be correct. Here in southcentral PA, with the exception of the old Big Spring barrier (which has been removed), I don't know of any significant cases where barriers have been built to protect brookies. In the case of this particular stream, a barrier might be effective - if, in fact, chubs are detrimental to brookies. I think creek chubs are native to brookie watersheds and if this is the case than theoretically brookies ought to tolerate them fairly well. The section you fished may be an "overlap" area where, this year, chubs are more numerous due to weather conditions. You might consider walking the creek and watching for spawners, if you see chubs swarming them than I'd say the question is answered. A barrier might be the best solution as it will also keep out browns, 'bows, and smallmouth bass, which are likely harder on the brookies than chubs.