

---

Subject: : Paflyfish General Forum

Topic: : Brookie versus Brownie habitat ?

Re: Brookie versus Brownie habitat ?

Author: : pcray1231

Date: : 2013/9/11 8:54:42

URL:

There's no question that browns generally dominate limestone waters, and even downstream freestone areas, while the traditional brookie holdouts are freestone headwaters. There are exceptions in both directions, but I'm not sure how you got your prejudice, as it's not a normal one.

The question to why. Well, I don't think its as much temperature related as a question of dominance and pH. Browns are dominant, I think. Where browns can establish strong populations, they do, to the detriment of the brookies.

The traditional holdout of brookie land is headwater freestoners. Why? Acid. Such streams are more acidic, and brookies can handle acid better than browns. At least that's the obvious consensus. I'm sure habitat type, bottom structure (breeding), etc. have something to do with it too. Because even in those headwaters, you typically do get the occasional brown. Further, water temperatures from breeding-->hatching might have a lot to do with it (that would be late fall through winter into early spring, limestoners staying too warm).

Our headwater freestone streams stay quite cold. Often colder than most limestoners. But they are very small, fast, streams in the forested mountains.

Point being though, is that brookies used to be EVERYWHERE, browns are invaders. Browns have pretty much taken over wherever they want. In spots that browns can't establish real strong populations, well, those are the places where brookies still reign.

Even in freestoners which contain both species, you'll notice a pretty consistent trend. The headwater areas are dominated by brookies, with maybe the odd brown here and there. As you go downstream, it fades to browns, with occasional brookies. Unless there is a waterfall or something separating, there is overlap. Some streams even have "battle lines". i.e. the line separating brown dominance vs. brookie dominance moves each year, it moves down one year, up the next, etc.