Subject: : Paflyfish General Forum
Topic: : Interesting Study
Re: Interesting Study
Author: : Rowbear
Date: : 2013/6/25 18:27:35
URL:

Hey all,

Shane, thanks for the invitation to view this thread and jump in. It's interesting to see this getting discussed in an angling forum! I don't have much time to respond to everything posted in response, but I thought I'd add a few quick bits:

1) The evidence for interbreeding between hatchery and wild BKT is mixed, in fact it is VERY mixed. Some disagreement between studies may be due to differences in methods. We feel very confident that our results are solid, ie. the methodology was sound. I am also equally confident that these results don't apply everywhere, but rather describe what happened in this particular situation. The point we thought was important was to underscore that it does vary, and its important to evaluate the integrity of wild stocks and not write them off as 'compromised' even if they have a long history of being stocked upon.

2) In terms of how this lack of interbreeding happened, there are lots of possibilities. All of the ones suggested here are possible and valid. There was another study that showed even different strains of wild BKT don't always interbreed as much as you would expect when they throw them in the mix together. This is something I would love to study more and is a very interesting ecological question.

3) The longevity of the hatchery strain in the system is a real interesting question. If stocking is stopped, it could be that the hatchery fish will disappear in a decade or even shorter. That has been the case in some systems, but not in others. This most certainly depends on the strain itself and its vigor in the wild, and a strain stocked in Virginia may blink out while the same strain stocked in New Hampshire may persist for decades.

I'm sure the lack of conclusive answers is frustrating here, and there is certainly some value to taking a precautionary approach to hatchery supplementation when trying to preserve wild stocks. It has value and it has risk, in my opinion. In the end it comes down to what we value, as one person suggested here. But there are many scientists out there that hold much stronger opinions on this than me, and many of them have been studying this question longer than I have. If you have any specific questions about this study I would be happy to answer them. If you have questions about some of the larger implications of hatchery vs. wild debates, I can offer my opinion on that but can't answer all the questions it raises. It's definitely fun to talk about though and I always like hearing other people's take on it.

Thanks for your interest in this work!