
Subject: : Paflyfish General Forum

Topic: : From the minnow chaser thread - An ethics lesson

Re: From the minnow chaser thread - An ethics lesson

Author: : Fishidiot

Date: : 2013/1/20 7:59:22

URL:

Quote:

TimMurphy wrote:

Deliberately fishing for 5 inch trout is not ethical, period.

Deliberately hooking sub-legal fish for the purpose of amusement violates the rules of ethical behavior, no matter how much care you exercise in the process.

Tim Murphy

Tim,

Danglooking to stir the pot today eh? 😏

Okay, I'll take the bait (offered, no doubt, on a very small hook). 😏

Fish size is relative. A 5" brook trout is a fully grown, sexually mature fish in many waters.

The problem with your assertion is the conception of what constitutes "legal sized." If it's unethical to target "sub legal" fish.....then, by this reasoning, it would be unethical to to cast to a foot long trout rising in a stream managed under "Trophy Trout" regs. After all, that fish is "sub-legal." And what about other fish? One cannot, in my view, select different fishes in a vacuum when making philosophical assertions. Take bluegills for example. They have no minimum size limit (to my knowledge). Is it therefore ethical to target 5" bluegills and not 5" brookies merely because one species has a minimum size? I think in many PA waters, the bluegills have a larger average size than the brookies. Personally, I have no problem catching 5" brookies or 5" bluegills. To condemn as unethical one who fishes for fish that are deemed "sub-legal" when "legal" is a largely arbitrary concept is rather unfair in my view. Certainly, one ought to consider typical fish size when choosing hook size as a matter of practicality. It's worth remembering that a 5" brookie has a much larger mouth with its eyes further from the jawline than a bluegill of the same length. Should the PFBC, in a good faith effort to protect fish of a certain size.....put regs in place to limit the size of the hook relative to the fish's morphology? It would be almost impossible to reasonably construe such a reg because of the diversity of fish size and species across PA.

There's nothing wrong with catching a 5" brookie in a stream with a 7" "legal size limit anymore than there's anything wrong with catching a 14" bass in a river with "Big Bass" regs. My thoughts for what they're worth.